

Bhavya's Concept of *Nirvāṇa*:

Madhyamakahr̥daya-kārikā III. 109–116

with the *Tarkajvālā*

Chikafumi Watanabe

Introduction

The aim of the present paper is to clarify Bhavya's concept of *nirvāṇa* discussed in *Madhyamakahr̥daya-kārikā* (hereafter, MHK) III. 109–116 and its *svavṛtti*, *Tarkajvālā* (hereafter, TJ) through my own translation of the texts. My translation of the MHK is based upon the Sanskrit texts edited by Ejima¹. I have also referred to the photocopy of the MHK manuscript published in China², photographs of Gokhale's notes published by Bahulkar³ and the Sanskrit texts edited by Iida, Lindtner and Heitmann⁴. Translation of the TJ was made from my own edition which will appear after the translation section in this paper (For the details of my edition, see "Introductory Remarks"). The following is the list of abbreviations employed in the translation.

- D *sDe dge* edition of the Tibetan Tripiṭaka
MK *Madhyamaka-Kārikā* in the *Prasannapadā*.
P Peking edition of the Tibetan Tripiṭaka.
PP *Prajñā-Pradīpa*, *sDe dge* No.3853, Peking No. 5253.

PPT *Prajñā-pradīpa-Ṭikā*, sDe dge No. 3859, Peking No. 5259.
PTSD *Pali Text Society's Pali-English Dictionary*.
Pras *Prasannapadā*.
SN *Samyuta-Nikāya*.

Translation

Here, [an opponent]⁵ states that because its abandonment (**prahāṇa*) is described, it is the case that passion (**rāga*) is certainly existent. For [the following] has been declared by the Blessed One:

“extinction of craving (**trṣṇā-kṣaya*) which has arisen simultaneously with the passion for rejoicing (**nandī-rāga*)⁶, dispassion (**virāga*) and destruction (**nirodha*) is *nirvāṇa*.”⁷

We reply: according to the doctrine (**naya*) that has been described, since it is not the case that passion is an existent,

it is not proper that through its abandonment, *nirvāṇa* comes into existence, for it is not reasonable. In ultimate reality (**paramārthatas*), **nirvāṇa* is void of the characteristics of existence and non-existence (*dnogs dang dnogs med mtshan nyid*, **bhāvābhāva-lakṣaṇatva*). //109//

Because **nirvāṇa* cannot bear the examination (**vicāra*) in ultimate reality (**paramārthas*), it is indeed not proper [that through the abandonment of passion, *nirvāṇa* comes into existence]. If you were to say 'how':

here, the **Vaibhāṣikas* desire that “**nirvāṇa* is a substantial entity (**dravya-sat*), permanent (**sāsvatā*) and that which consists of eternity

(**nitya-bhāvātmaka*).

The *Sautrāntikas and *Tāmraśāṭṭiyās maintain that “there is only **nirvāṇa* where no possessions remain (**nirupadhi-śeṣa-nirvāṇa*). One’s mind is emancipated, just as the light of a lamp (**dīpa*) is extinguished.⁸”

The *Vātsīputrīyas state that “[*nirvāṇa*] has both existence and non-existence (**bhāvābhāva*) as [its] nature, because *nirvāṇa* has no body (**kāya*), sense-organ (**indriya*) and cognition (**buddhi*), [it] is non-existent, [but] because [*nirvāṇa*] possesses happiness (**sukha*) which is absolute (**atyanta*) and incomparably the best (**anuttara*), [it] is existent.”

Through the negation of its existence and non-existence, [something which has] both [existence and non-existence] as [its] nature also will be negated. Therefore, first of all, what has [both] existence and non-existence as [its] nature (**bhāvābhāvātmaka*) should be negated.⁹

If *nirvāṇa* is indeed an existent (*bhāva*), then because it is an existent, that [*nirvāṇa*] would be a conditioned [entity], //110ab//¹⁰

In what has been said [in the above verse], [the word] ‘*bhāva*’ refers to an ‘existent’ because it comes into being (**bhavati*). [That is to say,] it means [that an existent is an entity] conditioned (**saṃskṛta*) by causes and conditions. Therefore, when *nirvāṇa* is inferred [as an existent], because [its] unconditionedness (**asaṃskṛtatva*) is rejected by conditionedness (**saṃskṛtatva*), the intrinsic nature [i.e., unconditionedness,] of **dharmin* [i.e., *nirvāṇa*,] is harmed.

When, moreover, [you] desire that **nirvāṇa* be the antidote to a conditioned [entity], if [it] is a conditioned [entity],

Thesis; [*nirvāṇa*] is not the antidote [to a conditioned entity] too,

Reason; because [it] is a conditioned entity,

Example; just like the destruction of a conditioned [entity]. //110cd//

It will become as stated above. [On the other hand,]

if [*nirvāṇa*] is indeed a nonexistent entity (*abhāva*),

[Thesis;] it depends upon others¹¹,

[Reason;] because it does not exist [by itself].

[Example;] just as what has already disappeared (*nāśitavat*).

Moreover,

[Thesis;] it is not desired that this is the antidote [to *saṃsāra*],

[Reason;] because it depends upon others,

[Example;] just as what has already disappeared. //111//

In what has been said [in the above verse], [the word] '*abhāva*' and insubstantial entity (**adravya-sat*) are synonymous (**paryāya*). If *nirvāṇa* has the nature of a nonexistence, because [its] happiness etc. are not possible, just like the sky-flower, the intrinsic nature [of *nirvāṇa*] is harmed. It [i.e., *nirvāṇa*], moreover, depends upon others, because it does not exist [by itself], just as what has already disappeared. For instance, it is well known in [our] world that the lamp is illuminated from the gathering of an oil-burner, oil, the heart [of a lamp,] etc. [However, its illumination] becomes a nonexistent later. It is just like [something which] depends upon other existing entities. [Likewise,] **nirvāṇa* which is non-clinging to existence (**anupādāna*) and nonexistence (**abhāva*) [and which arises] from the extinction of craving, i.e., continuity of aggregates (**skandha-saṃtāna*) also depends upon the other existing entities, just as the light of a lamp has already disappeared.

When you admit that **nirvāṇa* is non-destruction (**avināsa*) and

permanent (**sāsvata*), if [it] depends upon others, and is just like what has already disappeared, then it is also not agreeable that [*nirvāṇa*] is the antidote to **saṃsāra*.

Then, [if you were to say that the following is stated] in a [certain] **āgama*¹²:

“Monks, that **nirvāṇa* exists as what has not arisen yet, what has not emerged yet and what has the nature of the unconditioned.”

So, is [*nirvāṇa*] not an unconditioned [entity] as its nature?” We reply:

it is not proper that [*nirvāṇa*] is an unconditioned [entity] too, because its contradiction (*pratiṣedha*) has already been described. //112ab//

If it is the case that [*nirvāṇa*] is substantially existent (**dravya-sat*), [it would] be an existent. Therefore, since it is a conditioned [entity], it would have the nature of the conditioned, but [it] would not be an unconditioned [entity], because [its] deficiency (**doṣa*) has already been described.

If [you] observe that **nirvāṇa* is substantially existent, is what can be designated, is what has been arisen yet and is what has permanentness, [then, we state as follows:]

is there any distinction between this [*nirvāṇa*] and emancipated mind imagined by the Sāṃkhyas? //112cd//

The Sāṃkhyas also desire that what is called **caitanya*—unproduced,

impermanent, and extremity of 'effect (**kārya*) and cause' (**kāraṇa*)— is the intrinsic nature of **puruṣa*, [and it] exists as the emancipated self (**ātman*). Therefore, those who have the fixed view that 'because two discriminations, i.e., what is to be cognized and the cognizer (**grāhya-grāhaka*), are released, all objects are taken in and are not performed outside' also hold the same opinion as the Sāṃkhyas.

It is also not reasonable that **nirvāṇa* has the nature of extinction. If you were to say 'why?,' [we reply:]

afflictions (*kleśās*) arise from the pieces of wood (*araṇi*), i.e., discriminations (*vikalpa*), and are extinguished by their own sap (or naturally, *sva-rasa-kṣayiṇaḥ*). Because they are not accumulated, from which extinction does your emancipation (*mokṣa*) arise and become extinct? //113//

Afflictions, also, are produced by false imagination (**abhūta-parikalpa*). The mind¹³ is afflicted by obstructions (**āvaraṇa*), such as anger (**pratigha*) etc. like the impurity in the water-world and the clouds in the sky-world, and they too are separated from the discrimination (**vikalpa*) by the arising of proper knowledge (**samyag-jñāna-utpatti*). Therefore, because there is no accumulation [of afflictions], [they] are extinguished naturally, when they do not have connection/binding (**samyojana*) from the very beginning, how can there be extinction? Because there is no extinction, from what is it emancipated? Accordingly, relying on which extinction, do [you] desire that your emancipation, which has the nature of extinction, exist?

Afflictions, moreover, are indeed unproduced, because [they] are non-arising by [their] own nature (**svabhāvena*). Because they are nonexistent, there is no accumulation [of afflictions]. When there is no

accumulation [of afflictions], by what is it bound and from what is it emancipated? Therefore,

because what has not been produced yet does not exist, [such] conceptual consciousness [will be negated in] the same way [above]. //114ab//

It is stated [as above].

The questions should be discussed, from which extinction does the emancipation comes into existence; [does it come into existence from extinction] of what is extinguished? Or [does it come into existence from extinction] of what is not extinguished? //114cd//

First, when what is extinguished is naturally extinguished, just like the light of a lamp, [the coming into existence of] emancipation is not acceptable. [Next,] as to what is not extinguished too, because it is not extinguished, just like space (**ākāśa*), there is no [coming into existence of] emancipation. If you were to ask 'does emancipation never exist?', [we answer that it] exists in conventional reality, [but] it does not exist in ultimate reality. If you were to say 'why?', [we reply:]

because such concept (*mati*), also, is removed by realizing emptiness of own-being (*svabhāva-śūnyatā*), one attains *dharmahood* of non-extinction by means of non-attainment. //115//

When it is properly understood that the afflictions and mind (**citta*) are empty as [their] own nature, then because intrinsic nature of all

dharmas is not perceived, the concept of emancipation, also, is removed. Accordingly, because there is no accumulated afflictions, [one] attains *dharmahood* of non-extinction. It is because non-attainment indeed is the attainment. As the following is declared by the Blessed One:¹⁴

“I have arisen from the terrace of enlightenment without attainment.”

Likewise, [the following] is declared by him:¹⁵

“Elder, Śāradvatīputra, there is also attainment and there is a realization too, but these two are stated by conventional expression. In ultimate reality, [these two] do not exist,”

and so on. Therefore, because we do not rely on what is desired by opponents, [the following] is said:

Those who have desire for their own [benefit] and examine [things] as-they-are do not rely on the words which are impregnated with the stench (*durgandha*) due to sickness of the wrong view (*kudṛṣṭy-āmaya*) and are spat out. //116//

The pundits (**paṇḍitā*) who have desire for their own benefit and who examine [things] as-they-are do not rely on the words which are composed according to your own wishes. If you were to say ‘why?’, [we reply:] it is because your words are the words which are impregnated with the stench due to sickness of the wrong view (**ku-dṛṣṭi*) and are spat out. The wrong view indeed is sickness, and the very same is the stench. The words which are impregnated with that [stench] and are

spat out and which have these characteristics already described are the words which are impregnated with the stench due to sickness of the wrong view and are spat out. [The pundits] do not rely on them. Thus, each sentence is connected.

If you were to say: 'in the case that [we] rely on them, is there any fault?,' [we reply: there is a fault which] gains retributions of the erroneous view (**mithyā-dṛṣṭi-vipāka*), which are a hell (**naraka*), world of animal creatures (**tiryag-yoni*) and Yama's world (**yama-loka*). It is because [the following] is declared:¹⁶

"If you say that one who has belief is affected by sin (**doṣa*), [and] the other one who is angry [is afflicted] with hatred (**dveṣa*), but the one who has belief burns down [that sin by himself], [then,] is there any necessity for thinking of those who have hatred?"

Notes

- 1 Ejima 1980. For my translation of other portions of MHK III, See Watanabe 1998, 1999, 2002 and 2012.
- 2 Jiang 1991: 511–522.
- 3 Bahulkar 1994.
- 4 Iida 1980, Lindtner 2001 and Heitmann 2009.
- 5 Cf. Pras, p. 525, ll. 1–7 and Stcherbatsky 1965: 190–191.
- 6 According to Kajiyama (1980: 64 n. 2), there are similar passages in the Pali canon. SN vol. V, p. 421, ll. 25–28: *idaṃ kho pana bhikkhave dukkha-samudayam ariya-saccam// yāyaṃ taṇhā ponobbhavikā nandī rāga-sahagatā tatra tatrābhinandini// seyyathidaṃ// kāma-taṇhā bhava-taṇhā vibhava-taṇhā//*, etc.

Kajiyama mentions that the term "nandī-rāga (nandī-rāga)" is understood as *dvandva* in Pali (PTSD, p. 346), and that the term (Tib. *dga' bā'i 'dod chags*) is understood as *tat-puruṣa* in the Tibetan translation of PP. In the Tibetan translation of the TJ the term "nandī-rāga" is also understood as *tat-puruṣa*. See my edition of the TJ in this article.

- 7 Cf. PP (D234b-6, P294a-8): *dge' pa'i 'dod chags dang ldan pa'i sred pa de zad cing/ bral ba gang yin pa de nyi mya ngan las 'das pa'o ...* and Pras (p. 525, ll. 3-4): *nanu ca yo 'syā nandī-rāga-sahagatāyās tṛṣṇāyāḥ kṣayo virāgo nirodho nirvāṇam ity uktam/*
- 8 Cf. PP (D234b-6, P294b-1): *ma zhum pa yi lus kyis ni// tshor ba dang du len pa na// de yin sems ni rnam par grol// mar me shi bar gyur pa bzhin//*, Pras (p. 520, ll. 6-7): *asaṃlinena kāyena vedanām adhyavāsayat/ pradyotasyeva nirvāṇam vimokṣas tasya cetasaḥ//* and Theragāthā 906, *Mahā-parinibbāna-suttanta* (DN, vol. II, p. 157, ll. 14-15): *asallīnena cittaṇa vedanaṃ ajjhavāsayaṃ, pajjotass' eva nibbānaṃ vimokkha cetaso aḥū.*
- 9 Cf. PP (D237a-1, P297a-4): *gzhan dag gis smras pa/ thar pa'i don ni dngos po yang yin la/ dngos po med pa yang yin pa'i phyir/ gnyi ga'i bdag nyid yin pa'i phyir skyon med do// gzhan dag gis smras pa/ de'i phyir 'di bshad de/ gal te mya ngan 'das pa ni// dngos dang dngos med gnyis yin la// dngos dang dngos po med pa dag// thar par 'gyur bar de mi rigs//XXV. 11//*
- dgag pa mi mthun pa'i phyir te/ gal te dngos po yin na ji ltar dngos po med pa yin/ ci ste dngos po med pa yin na ni dngos po zhes bya ba ma yin no// ci ste yang ltos pa'i dbang gis dngos po dang dngos po med pa'i mtshan nyid yin te/ lus dang/ dbang po dang/ blo med pa'i phyir dngos po med pa yin la/ bde ba la zla med pa gtan du ba dang ldan pa'i phyir dngos po yin no zhe na/ de ni bzang po ma yin te/ lus la sogs pa'i skye ba bkag pa kho nas/ de dag med pa bkag pa'i phyir dang/ bde ba la zla med pa gtan ngu ba yang 'dus byas kyi skye ba bkag pa kho nas bkag pa'i phyir dang/ bde ba 'dus ma byas pa yod pa nyid du ston pa'i rjes su dpog pa med pa'i phyir de ni rigs pa ma yin no//*
- According to the PPT, the opponents in the PP are the Nirgranthas. See PPT, D257a-2 below and P305b-4 below.
- 10 Cf. MK (p. 526, l. 1): *bhāvaś ca yadi nirvāṇam nirvāṇam saṃskṛtam bhavet //XXV. 5ab//* and PP (D236a-2, P295b-8): *mya ngan las 'das pa dngos po yin par smra ba dag gi phyir bshad pa/ gal te mya ngan 'das dngos na// mya ngan 'das pa 'dus byas 'gyur//XXV. 5ab// 'das byas yin par ni mi 'dod de/ 'dis ni mya ngan las 'das pa'i chos ni 'dus byas nyid ma yin par bstan to//*
- 11 Cf. MK (p. 526, ll. 9-10): *bhāvaś ca yadi nirvāṇam anupādāya tat katham/ nirvāṇam nanupādāya kaścid bhāvo hi vidyate //XXV. 6//* and PP (D236a-4, P296a-3): *yang na sbyor pa'i lam gzhan yang yod de/ gal te mya ngan 'das dngos na// ji ltar myang 'das de brten min//XXV. 6ab// dngos po ni brten nas gdags par bya ba nyid med na ni 'byung ba'i phyir ro zhes bya bar dgongs so// 'dis ni mya ngan las 'das pa'i chos ni brten nas gdags par bya ba nyid ma*

yin par bstan to// de nyid kyī phyir bshad pa/

dngos po brten par ma yin pa/

'ga' yang yod pa ma yin no//XXV. 6cd//

gang ma brten par yod pa'i dngos po ni 'ga' yang med do// 'dis ni chos mthun pa'i

phyogs kyī dpe bstan to//

12 I could not identify this *āgama*.

13 Both Nozawa (1965: 74) and Iida [1980: 201] do not translate the word *sems* in their translations of the TJ.

14 I could not identify this *āgama*.

15 I could not identify this *āgama* also.

16 I could not find a textual source of this citation.

Sanskrit Text of *Madhyamakahr̥daya-kārikā* III.

109–116 with Tibetan Text of the *Tarkajvālā*

Introductory Remarks

The following Sanskrit text of MHK III. 109-116 is based upon the Sanskrit manuscript of MHK, the photographs of Gokhale's notes of MHK and the Sanskrit texts edited by Ejima, Iida, Lindtner and Heitmann. For the text of the TJ, the *sDe dge*, the University of Tokyo edition, has been utilized as the basic text upon which the editions of *Co ne*, Peking and Iida's edition have been compared. Abbreviations and signs employed in the following text are as follows:

- CK *Co ne* edition of the Tibetan translation of the *Madhyamaka-hṛdaya-kārikā*.
- CT *Co ne* edition of the Tibetan translation of the *Tarkajvālā*.
- DK *sDe dge* edition of the Tibetan translation of the *Madhyamaka-hṛdaya-kārikā*.
- DT *sDe dge* edition of the Tibetan translation of the *Tarkajvālā*.
- E Kārikā text of Sanskrit and Kārikā text of Tibetan of MHK ed. in Ejima 1980.
- G Photocopy of Gokhale's handcopy of Sanskrit Manuscript of the *Madhyamaka-hṛdaya-kārikā* in Bahulkar 1994.
- H Kārikā text of Sanskrit ed. in Heitmann 2009.
- I Kārikā text in Sanskrit, Kārikā text in Tibetan and Tibetan text of *Tarkajvālā* ed. in Iida 1980.
- L Kārikā text ed. in Lindtner 2001.
- Ms Photocopy of Sanskrit Manuscript of the *Madhyamaka-hṛdaya-kārikā* in Jiang 1991.
- N Nozawa's Japanese translation of the *Tarkajvālā*.

- PK Peking edition of the Tibetan translation of the *Madhyamaka-hṛdaya-kārikā*.
- PT Peking edition of the Tibetan translation of the *Tarkajvālā*.
- [] Folio No.
- () The syllables are unclear and illegible, but are to be supposed.
- + The space for one syllable is damaged.
- em. emend to
- om. omitted

Text

[DT83b-2, CT83b-2, PT89b-1] 'dir smras pa / 'dod chags ni yod pa kho na
 yin te / de spang ba¹ bstan [DT83b-3, PT89b-2] pa'i phyir [CT83b-3] ro //
 'di ltar bcom ldan 'das kyis

dga' ba'i 'dod chags dang² lhan cig skyes pa'i sred pa zad pa dang /
 'dod chags dang bral ba dang / 'gog pa gang yin pa de ni mya ngan
 las 'das pa'o //³

zhes gsungs [PT89b-3] pa'i phyir ro zhe na / bshad pa⁴ ji skad bstan pa'i
 tshul [DT83b-4] gyis⁵ 'dod [CT83b-4] chags yod pa ma yin pa'i phyir /

tat-prahāṇān na nirvāṇam yujyate tad-ayogataḥ /⁶

----- //109//⁷

[DK7b-4, CK7b-4, PK8b-3] de spangs phyir ni mya ngan 'das //
 mi rigs de nyid mi 'thad phyir //

mya ngan 'das pa don dam du //⁸

[PK8b-4] dngos dang dngos med mtshan nyid min //⁹

zhes [PT89b-4] bya ba ni mya ngan las 'das pas don dam par dpyad¹⁰ pa
mi bzod [DT83b-5] pa'i phyir de nyid mi [CT83b-5] rigs so // ji ltar zhe
na /

'di la bye brag tu smra ba dag ni mya ngan las 'das pa rdzas su yod
pa dang / rtag pa dang rtag pa'i dngos po [PT89b-5] bdag nyid du 'dod
do //

mdo sde pa dang gos dmar sde pa dag ni phung po med pa tsam
ste / mar me shi bar gyur pa ltar // de yi¹¹ [DT83b-6, CT83b-6] sems ni
rnam par thar // zhes¹² brjod do //

gnas ma bu'i sde pa dag ni dngos po dang dngos [PT89b-6] po med
pa gnyi ga'i bdag nyid de / gang gi phyir mya ngan las 'das pa ni lus dang
bdang po dang /¹³ blo med pa'i phyir dngos po med pa yin la / gtan gyi
bde ba bla na med pa dang ldan [CT83b-7] pa'i phyir [DT83b-7] dnogs po
yin no //¹⁴ zhes zer ro //¹⁵

[PT89b-7] de'i dngos po dang dngos po med pa bkag pas gnyi ga'i bdag
nyid kyang bkag pa byas par 'gyur bas de'i phyir re zhig dngos po dang
dngos po med pa'i bdag nyid dgag par bya ste /

bhāvo hi yadi nirvāṇam bhāvatvāt saṃskṛtam hi tat //110ab//

gal te mya ngan 'das dngos na //

[PT89b-8] dnogs po yin phyir de 'dus [CT 84a-1] byas //

[DT84a-1] zhes bya ba la dngos po zhes bya ba 'byung ba'i phyir dngos
po ste / rgyu dang rkyen rnam kyis¹⁶ 'dus byas pa zhes bya ba'i tha tshig
go // de'i phyir mya ngan las 'das pa dngos por rjes su dpog [PT90a-1]
pas 'dus byas nyid kyis 'dus ma byas nyid bsal ba'i phyir chos [DT84a-2,
CT84a-2] can gyi ngo bo nyid nyams so //

gzhan yang mya ngan las 'das pa ni 'dus byas kyī gnyen po yin par
'dod na / gal te 'dus byas [PT90a-2] yin na /

*sāmskr̥tatvād vipakṣo 'pi na sāmskr̥ta-nirodhavat*¹⁷ //110cd//
[CK7b-5] gnyen po¹⁸ ma yin 'dus byas phyir //
dper na [DK7b-5] 'dus byas 'gags¹⁹ pa bzhin //

zhes bya ba ltar 'gyur ro //

*abhāvo yady abhāvatvān*²⁰ *nāśitavat*²¹ *parāśrayah*²² /
*neṣṭāś ca pratipakṣo 'sau nāśitavat*²³ *parāśrayāt*²⁴ //111//
gal te dngos med [DT84a-3] gzhan rten²⁵ [CT84a-3] 'gyur //²⁶
dngos po med phyir zhig pa bzhin //
de ni gnyen por mi [PT90a-3] 'dod de //
gzhan la rten²⁷ phyir zhig bzhin no //

zhes bya ba la dngos po med pa dang / rdzas su yod pa ma yin pa dag
ni rnam grangs te / gal te mya ngan las²⁸ 'das pa dngos po med pa nyid
[DT84a-4] yin na bde ba nyid la sogs [CT84a-4] par mi [PT90a-4] 'thad
pa'i phyir / nam mkha'i me tog bzhin pas ngo bo nyid nyams so // de
gzhan la rten²⁹ pa yin par yang 'gyur te / dngos po med pa'i phyir zhig
pa bzhin te / dper na kon bu dang 'bru³⁰ mar dang snying po la sogs
pa [PT90a-5] 'dus pa las [DT84a-5] mar me zhes bya bar 'jig rten la
[CT84a-5] grags pa physis dngos po med par gyur pa ni dngos po gzhan la
rten³¹ pa bzhin du mya ngan las 'das pa phung po'i rgyun gyi sred pa zad
pa las len pa med pa dang / dngos po [PT90a-6] med pa zhes bya ba yang
mar me zhig pa bzhin du dngos po la rten³² pa [DT84a-6] nyid du 'gyur
ro³³ //

khyed cag mya ngan [CT84a-6] las³⁴ 'das pa ni mi 'jig pa dang rtag

par khas len na de gzhan la rten³⁵ pa dang /³⁶ zhig pa lta bu yin na 'khor
ba'i gnyen po nyid [PT90a-7] yin par yang mi 'thad do //

'o na lung las /³⁷

dge slong dag mya ngan las 'das pa de ni [DT84a-7] ma skyes pa
dang /

ma byung ba dang / 'dus ma byas [CT84a-7] pa³⁸ nyid du yod
do <//>

zhes gsungs pas 'dus ma byas pa'i bdag nyid kyi mya ngan las [PT90a-8]
'das pa ma yin nam zhe na / bshad pa /³⁹

*asamśkrto 'py ayukto 'sau pūrvokta-pratiūedhataḥ*⁴⁰ //112ab//

de ni 'dus ma byas mi rigs //

dgag⁴¹ pa gong [PK8b-6] du [CK7b-6] bstan pa'i phyir //

zhes bya ba ni [DT84b-1] gal te de rdzas su yod pa yin na dngos po yin
pa'i phyir / [CT84b-1] de 'dus byas yin pa'i phyir de 'dus [PT90b-1] byas
nyid du 'gyur gyi / 'dus ma byas ma yin te /⁴² skyon gong du bstan pa'i
phyir ro //

gal te mya ngan las 'das pa rdzas su yod pa dang tha snyad gdags
su rung ba nyid dang ma skyes pa dang rtag [DT84b-2] tu gnas pa nyid
du brtag grang na

cittā⁴³ viśeṣaḥ kaś cāsyā muktāt sāmkhya-prakalpitāt //112cd//

[PT90b-2] grangs can dag gis [CT84b-2] rab brtags⁴⁴ [DK7b-6]

pa'i //

grol ba'i sems las khyad ci yod //

ces bya ba ni grangs can dag kyang shes pa yod pa nyid ces bya ba ma
 skyes pa mi 'jig⁴⁵ pa bya ba dang / byed pa mthar thug pa ni skyes bu'i
 ngo bo [PT90b-3] nyid yin no zhes [DT84b-3] grol⁴⁶ ba'i bdag nyid yod
 par 'dod pas gang dag gis [CT84b-3] gzung ba dang / 'dzin pa'i rnam
 par rtog pa gnyis dang bral ba'i phyir /⁴⁷ don thams cad nang du bsdu ba
 dang / phyi rol tu spyod pa med par [PT90b-4] nges par brtags pa de dag
 kyang grangs can gyi grub pa'i mtha' dang mtshungs so //

[DT84b-4] mya ngan las 'das pa ni zad pa nyid yin par yang mi rigs
 [CT84b-4] te / ji ltar zhe na /

svarasa-kṣayīṇaḥ kleśā vikalpārāni-sāmbhavāḥ /

*teṣām asaṃcīteḥ keṣām kṣayān mokṣo 'stu te kṣayaḥ*⁴⁸ //113//

nyon mongs rnam rtog gsub shing las //

byung ba [PT90b-5] rang gi ngang zad pa //

de la bsags⁴⁹ pa yod min pas //

[PK8b-7] gang zad⁵⁰ khyod thar⁵¹ ni⁵² zad 'gyur //

zhes bya ba yin te / nyon mongs pa yang [DT84b-5] dag pa ma yin pa'i
 kun tu rtog pas kun nas [CT84b-5] bslang ba chu'i khams kyi rnyog pa
 [PT90b-6] dang /⁵³ nam mka'i khams kyi sbrin la sogs pa lta bu'i sgrib pa
 khong khro ba la sogs pa dag gis sems kun nas nyon mongs par byed cing
 de dag kyang yang dag pa'i shes pa skyes pas rnam [DT84b-6] par rtog
 pa dang bral ba'i phyir [PT90b-7] bsags pa med pas [CT84b-6] rang gi
 rang nyid kyis⁵⁴ zad par 'gyur bas de dag la dang po nyid nas kun tu sbyor
 ba med na zad pa ga la yod/ zad pa med pa'i phyir gang las⁵⁵ thar par
 'gyur / de'i phyir gang gi zad pa la ltos⁵⁶ [PT90b-8] nas khyod kyi thar pa
 zad pa nyid yin⁵⁷ pa zhes [DT84b-7] bya bar⁵⁸ yod par 'dod /⁵⁹

yang na nyon mongs [CT84b-7] pa rnams ni ma skyes pa kho na
 yin te / ngo bo nyid kyis ma byung ba'i phyir ro // de dag yod pa ma yin

pa'i phyir bsags pa med do // [PT91a-1] bsags pa med na gang gis bcings
shing gang las thar par 'gyur te / de'i phyir

*ajātānām tathāsattvāt kalpanāyāḥ*⁶⁰ *samo nayaḥ* //114ab//
skye ba med [DT85a-1] la rtog pa yang //
de [CT85a-1] bzhin med phyir tshul nyid⁶¹ [CK7b-7] mtshungs //⁶²

zhes bya ba smras so //

vada kasya kṣayān mokṣaḥ kṣayṇo 'kṣayiṇo 'pi vā //114cd//
zad pa can nam [PT91a-2] zad med [DK7b-7] na //
gang gis⁶³ zad pas thar pa smros⁶⁴ //

zhes bya ba ni re zhid rang gi nang gis zad pa can mar me bzhin du zad
pa la ni thar pa mi 'thad do // zad [DT85a-2] pa can [CT85a-2] ma yin pa
la yang zad pa med pa'i phyir nam mka' [PT91a-3] lta bu la thar pa med
do // ci thar pa med pa kho na yin nam zhe na/ kun rdzob tu yod de⁶⁵ /
don dam par ni yod pa ma yin no⁶⁶ // gang gi phyir zhe na/

*svabhāva-śūnyatā-bodhān nirvṛttes tan mater api*⁶⁷ //
*akṣayākṣayi-dharmatvaṃ*⁶⁸ *prāpnoty aprāpti-yogataḥ* //115//
rang bzhin stong nyid rtogs⁶⁹ pa'i [PK8b-8] phyir //
de yi blo yang zlog⁷⁰ gyur pas //
[CT85a-3, PT91a-4] zad med [DT85a-3] mi zad chos nyid 'thob //
thob pa med pa'i tshul gyis so //⁷¹

zhes bya ba'i phyir te / gang gi tshe des nyon mongs pa rnam dang sems
rang bzhin stong pa nyid du legs par rtogs par gyur pa de'i tshe na / des
chos [PT91a-5] thams cad kyi ngo bo nyid mi dmigs pa'i phyir thar pa'i

[CT85a-4] blo yang zdog⁷² pas / nyon [DT85a-4] mongs pa bsags pa med pa'i phyir mi zad pas zad pa med pa'i chos nyid 'thob ste / thob pa med pa nyid thob pa yin pa'i phyir ro // [PT91a-6] ji skad du / bcom ldan 'das kyis

nga ni thob pa med pa kho nar byang chub kyi snying po las langs so < // >

zhes gsungs [CT85a-5] pa dang / de bzhin du /⁷³

tshe dang [DT85a-5] ldan pa sha ra dva ti'i bu thob pa yang yod / mngon par rtogs pa yang yod de / [PT91a-7] de ni 'jig rten gyi tha snyad kyis gnyis su brjod par zad kyid don dam par ni yod pa ma yin no //⁷⁴

zhes bya ba la sogs pa gsungs pa lta bu'o // de'i phyir kho bo cag ni pharol [CT85a-6] po dag 'dod pa la mi brten pas /

*nātma-kāmāḥ*⁷⁵ *śrayantīmāḥ yathābhūta-parīkṣakāḥ* /
kudṛṣṭy-āmaya-durgandha-saktodgārā giras tataḥ //116//
[DT85a-6] yang dag [PT91a-8] ji bzhin yongs rtogs⁷⁶ pa //
bdag la phan pa⁷⁷ 'dod pa dag //
lta ngan nad dri ngan [CK8a-1] bsgos⁷⁸ pa'i //
[DK8a-1, PK9a-1] sgregs⁷⁹ pa'i tshig⁸⁰ la rten⁸¹ mi byed //

ces bya ba smras te / khyed cag gi rang dgas nye bar sbyar ba'i tshig gang dag yin [PT91b-1] pa de dag la⁸² ni mkhas pa yang [CT85a-7] dag pa ji lta ba bzhin du [DT85a-7] yongs su rtog⁸³ pa bdag la phan par 'dod pa dag rten par mi byed do // gang gi phyir zhe na / 'di ltar khyod

kyi tshig de dag ni lta ba ngan pa'i nad dri nga bas [PT91b-2] bsgos⁸⁴ pa'i
 sgregrs pa'i tshig yin pa'i phyir ro // lta ba ngan pa nyid nad yin la⁸⁵ de
 nyid dri ngan pa yin te / des bsgos pa'i [CT85b-1] sgregrs pa'i [DT85b-1]
 tshig gang dag la khyad par ji skad bstan pa de lta bu yod pa de⁸⁶ dag ni
 lta ba [PT91b-3] ngan pa de'i nad dri nga bas bsgos pa'i sgregrs pa'i tshig
 dag yin te / de la rten⁸⁷ par mi byed do // ⁸⁸ zhes bya bar sbyar ro //

de dag la brten na ci nyes she⁸⁹ na / lta ba log pa'i rnam par smin pa
 gang dag yin pa [DT85b-2, CT85b-2, PT91b-4] dag 'thob par 'gyur te / de
 ni sems can dmyal ba'am dud 'gro'i skye gnas sam gshin rje'i 'jig rten dag
 yin te / ji skad du /

dad pa can ni nyes bzung bas //
 khros pa gzhan ni zhe sdang gis //
 dad pa [PT91b-5] can yang bsregs bstan na //
 zhe sdang can dag bsam ci [DT85b-3] dgos //

[CT85b-3] zhes gsungs pa'i phyir ro //

Notes

- 1 DT, CT ba: PT, I ba'i
- 2 PT, I om. dang
- 3 DT, CT om. //
- 4 PT om. /
- 5 DT, CT, I gyis: PT gyi
- 6 E, I, L, H tadayogataḥ: Ms tarayogataḥ, G (tara) yogtataḥ
- 7 Ms om. the *pāda* cd.
- 8 PT om. *mya ngan 'das pa don dam du* //
- 9 According to E, PT om. *dngos dang dngos med mtshan nyid min* //, but PT has this phrase.
- 10 DT, PT, I dpyad: CT dpyod
- 11 DT de yi: PT, I de'i

- 12 DT, CT zhes: PT ces
13 PT om. /
14 DT, CT om. //
15 PT om. //
16 DT, CT, PT kyis: I kyi
17 E, I, L, H: -nirodhavat: Ms, G -virodhavat
18 DK, CK, DT, CT, PT, E, I po: PK pa
19 DK, CK, PK, PT, E, I 'gags: DT, CT 'gag
20 G abhāvatvā(n), E, I, L, H abhāvatān: Ms abhāvatvā
21 E, H nāsitavat: Ms, G nāsitāvat, I, nāsitavat, L nāsitvād yah
22 Ms, G, E, H parāśrayaḥ: I, L parāśrayāt
23 E, I, L nāstavat: Ms L nāstāvat
24 Ms, G, E, I, H parāśrayāt: L parāśrayaḥ
25 PK, DT, CT, PT, E, I rten: DK, CK brten
26 PK has *gal te dngos med* [PK8b-5] *zhig pa bzhin/ gal te dngos med gzhan rten*
'gyur//
27 PK, DT, CT, PT, E rten: DK, CK, I brten
28 PT om. las
29 All the Tibetan text of the TJ have *brten*, but em. *rten*.
30 DT, CT, PT 'bru: I bru
31 All the Tibetan texts of the TJ have *brten*, but em. *rten*.
32 All the Tibetan texts of the TJ have *brten*, but em. *rten*.
33 PT, I om. ro
34 PT, I om. las
35 All the Tibetan texts of the TJ have *brten*, but em. *rten*.
36 PT om. /
37 PT om. /
38 PT, I om. pa
39 PT om. /
40 E, I, L, H pūrvoktapratīṣedhataḥ: G pūrvo (kta ++ tiṣe) dhataḥ, Ms pūrvo ++++
dhataḥ
41 DK, CK, DT, PT, E, I dgag: PK, gdag
42 DT, CT om. /
43 E, I, H cittāt: Ms, G, L citte
44 DK, DT, CK, CT, PK, E, I brtags: PT brtag
45 PT, I 'jig: DT, CT 'jigs
46 I has *glol*, but it is probably a typo.
47 DT, CT om. /
48 I, N kṣayaḥ: Ms, G, E, L, H 'kṣayaḥ.

- 49 E has *gsags*, but it is probably a typo.
- 50 TJ, E zad: DK, DT, CK, CT, PK, PT, I zag
- 51 DK, CK, DT, CT, E thar: PK, PT, I mthar
- 52 All the Tibetan texts have *mi*, but N em. *ni*. I adopt N's emendation.
- 53 PT om. /
- 54 DT, CT kyis: PT, I kyi
- 55 DT, CT om. las
- 56 DT, CT ltos: PT bltos
- 57 All the Tibetan texts have *med*, but N em. *nyid yin*. I adopt N's emendation.
- 58 DT, CT bar: PT ba de
- 59 PT om. /
- 60 E, L, H, kalpanāyāḥ: Ms, I kalpanāyām
- 61 DK, CK, PK, E nyid: DT, CT, PT, I gnyis
- 62 CT /
- 63 DT, CT, PT, E, I gis: DK, CK, PK, gi
- 64 DK, DT, CK, CT, PK, E, I smros: PT smos
- 65 DT, CT, PT de: I do
- 66 DT, CT no: PT, I te
- 67 G tanmatera(p)i, K de yi blo yang
- 68 G akṣayākṣayidharmatvaṃ (reconstructed from Tibetan?): Ms ++++++tva(m)
- 69 DK, CK, PK, DT, CT, E, I rtogs: PT rtog
- 70 DK, CK, PK, E, I zlog: DT, CT, PT, ldog
- 71 PT om. //
- 72 DT, CT, PT have *zdog*, but em. *zlog*
- 73 PT om. /
- 74 DT, CT om. //
- 75 E, I, L, H ātmakāmāḥ: Ms, G ātmakāmā
- 76 PK, PT, E, I rtogs: DK, CK, DT, CT rtog
- 77 DK, CK, PK, E pa: DT, CT, PT, I par
- 78 DK, DT, CK, CT, PK, E bsgos: PT, I bgos
- 79 DK, PK, DT, CT, E, I sgregs: PT bsregs, CK sgrigs
- 80 DK, CK, PK, DT, CT, E, I tshig: PT tshigs
- 81 DK, CK, DT, CT, E rten: PK, PT, I brten
- 82 I has *dgal*. It is probably a typo.
- 83 DT, CT rtog: PT, I rtag
- 84 I has *bsogs*, but it is probably a tyo.
- 85 PT la: DT, CT pa
- 86 PT om. *de*
- 87 DT, CT rten: PT, I brten

88 DT, CT om. //

89 DT, CT she: PT, I zhe

Bibliography

Sanskrit Texts

Madhyamaka-hṛdaya-kārikā III, ed. by Yasunori Ejima, "The Sanskrit text of Bhāvaviveka's *Madhyamaka-hṛdaya-kārikā* III. *Tattvajñānaiṣaṇā*, collated with its Tibetan version, and an Index of Sanskrit words," in *Development of Mādhyamika Philosophy in India: Studies on Bhāvaviveka* (in Japanese), Shunjusha, Tokyo: 1980.

Madhyamaka-hṛdaya-kārikā III. 1-136, ed. by Shotaro Iida, in *Reason and Emptiness: A Study in Logic and Mysticism*, Hokuseido Press, Tokyo: 1980.

Madhyamaka-hṛdayam of Bhavya, ed. by Christian Lindtner, The Adyar Library and Research Centre, Chennai: 2001.

Madhyamakahṛdayakārikā, Kapitel III in *Buddhistische Lefre Indiens: Textedition und -kritik von Bhavyas Madhyamakahṛdayakārikā* I-III, ed. by Annette L. Heitmann, PHILOLOGIA, Sprachwissenschaftliche Forschungsergebnisse, Band 130, Verlag Dr. Kovač, Hamburg: 2009.

Mūlamadhyamaka-kārikās (Mādhyamikasūtras) de Nāgārjuna avec la Prasannapadā Commentire de Candrakīrti, ed. by Louis de la Vallée Poussin, Bibliotheca Buddhica. IV, Biblio Verlag, Germany: 1970

Photocopy of the Sanskrit Manuscript of the *Madhyamaka-hṛdaya-kārikā*

Jian (1991), "Sanskrit Manuscript of the *Madhyamaka-hṛdaya-kārikā*," in *Papers in Honour of Prof. Dr. Ji Xianlin on the Occasion of this 80th Birthday*, ed. by Jiang Zhongxin, Duan Qian Wenzhong, Li Zheng, Peking: 1991, pp. 511-522.

Bahulkar, Shrikant S. (1994), "The *Madhyamaka-Hṛdaya-Kārikā* of Bhāvaviveka: A Photographic Reproduction of Prof. V. V. Gokhale's Copy," *Nagoya Studies in Indian Culture and Buddhism*, SAMBHĀṢĀ 15, Department of Indian Philosophy, University of Nagoya, Nagoya: 1994.

Pali Text

Dīga-Nikāya vol. 2, ed. by T. W. Rhys Davids and J. Estlin Carpenter, the Pali Text Society, London: 1966.

Samyutta-Nikāya part V, ed. by M. Leon Feer, the Pali Text Society, London: 1960.

Tibetan Text

Dbu ma'i snying po'i tshig le'ur byas pa (*Madhyamaka-hṛdaya-kārikā*), *sDe dge* edition No. 3855; the Tibetan Tripiṭaka, ed. by K. Hayashima, J. Takasaki, Z. Yamaguchi, and Y. Ejima, Sekai Seiten Kankō Kyōkai, Tokyo: 1977., Peking edition No. 5255; The Tibetan Tripiṭaka, ed. by D. Suzuki, Otani University, Tokyo-Kyoto: 1955–1961., *Co ne* edition, Tibetan Buddhist Resource Center, New York: 2003, vol. 19.

Dbu ma'i snying po'i tshig le'ur byas pa (*Madhyamakahṛdaya-vṛttitarkajvālā*), *sDe dge* edition, No. 3856; the Tibetan Tripiṭaka, ed. by K. Hayashima, J. Takasaki, Z. Yamaguchi, and Y. Ejima, Sekai Seiten Kankō Kyōkai, Tokyo: 1977., Peking edition, No. 5256; The Tibetan Tripiṭaka, ed. by D. Suzuki, Otani University, Tokyo-Kyoto: 1955–1961., *Co ne* edition, Tibetan Buddhist Resource Center, New York: 2003, vol. 19.

Dictionary

Pali-English Dictionary, ed. by T. W. Rhys Davids and William Stede, The Pali Text Society, Oxford: 1992 (First ed. 1921–1925).

Secondary Sources

- Iida, Shotaro (1989), *Reason and Emptiness: A Study of Logic and Mysticism*, Hokuseido Press, Tokyo.
- Kajiyama, Yuichi (1980), "The *Prajñāpradīpa* (the First Half of Chap. XXV): A Translation from the Tibetan Text," *Journal of the Esoteric Buddhism* vols. 16 and 17, Shuchiin University, pp. 40-68.
- Nozawa, Jyosho (1965), "A Japanese Translation of *Madhyamaka-hṛdaya-vṛtti-Tarkajvālā* III (8), *Quarterly Reports on Esoteric Buddhism* vol. 74, The Esoteric Buddhist Society, Koyasan University, pp. 80-64 (L).
- Stcherbatsky, Theodor (1965), *The Conception of Buddhist Nirvāṇa*, Mouton & Co, Netherlands.
- Watanabe, Chikafumi (1998), "A Translation of *Madhyamakahṛdayakārikā* with *Tarkajvālā* III. 137-146," *Journal of International Association of Buddhist Studies*, vol. 21-1, pp. 1-31.
- (1999), "Bhāviveka on Invalidations by *pratyakṣa* and by *pratīti*: *Madhyamakahṛdayakārikā* and *Tarkajvālā* III. 176-181," *Annals of the Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute*, vol. 80, pp. 155-166.
- (2002), "A Translation of *Madhyamakahṛdayakārikā* III. 182-191," *Subhāṣiṇī, Prof. Dr. Saroja Bhate Felicitation Volume*, The University of Pune, India, pp. 349-355.
- (2012), "*Madhyamakahṛdayakārikā* III. 147-158," *SAMSKṚTA-SĀDHUTĀ, GOODNESS OF SANSKRIT, Studies in Honour of Professor Ashok N. Aklujkar*, D.K. Printworld, New Delhi, India, pp. 545-551.